

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

PETRÓLEOS DE VENEZUELA, S.A., PDVSA  
PETRÓLEO, S.A., and PDV HOLDING, INC.,

Plaintiffs,

- against -

MUFG UNION BANK, N.A. and GLAS AMERICAS  
LLC,

Defendants.

Case No: 19-cv-10023-KPF

**DECLARATION OF KRISTIN BENDER IN SUPPORT OF  
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

I, Kristin Bender, hereby declare pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746 and Local Rule 7.1 as follows:

1. I am an attorney admitted to practice in this Court and a partner at Willkie Farr & Gallagher LLP, attorneys for plaintiff and counterclaim defendant PDV Holding, Inc. ("PDV Holding"). I submit this declaration to place before the Court certain documents referred to in the accompanying Supplemental Local Rule 56.1 Statement of Undisputed Material Facts in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment and Supplemental Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment filed in this action on January 17, 2025.

2. Capitalized terms used herein have the same meanings as in the Supplemental Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment filed herewith.

3. Attached to this declaration as Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of an excerpt from the Venezuelan Supreme Tribunal of Justice, Constitutional Chamber, case number 464, titled Interpretation of the Decree of the National Constituent Assembly dated January 30, 2000,

by Which the Negotiation of the Collective Labour Convention is Suspended for 3 Days, dated March 18, 2002 (certified and translated).

4. Attached to this declaration as Exhibit 2 is a true and correct copy of an excerpt of the Venezuelan Supreme Tribunal of Justice, Administrative Chamber, case titled Eduardo Contramaestre vs. República (Ministerio de Sanidad y Asistencia Social, dated April 6, 1993 (certified and translated).

5. Attached to this declaration as Exhibit 3 is a true and correct copy of an excerpt of the Venezuelan Supreme Tribunal of Justice, Administrative Chamber, case number 411, titled Banco del Caribe vs. República (Ministerio de Hacienda), dated August 13, 1991 (certified and translated).

6. Attached to this declaration as Exhibit 4 is a true and correct copy of an excerpt of Professor José Araujo-Juárez's treatise titled Treatise on General and Comparative Administrative Law, Volume 3: Administrative Act, published in 2024 (certified and translated).

7. Attached to this declaration as Exhibit 5 is a true and correct copy of *CITGO: The Biggest Theft in the History of Venezuela*, by the Special Commission to Investigate the Participation of Political Parties and Representatives of the Legislature of 2016-2021 in the Plundering and Theft of the Venezuelan Company CITGO Petroleum Corporation, dated April 2014 (certified and translated).

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief.

Executed this 17th day of January, 2025 in Washington, DC.

/s/ Kristin Bender  
Kristin Bender